THE USER-ORIENTED LIBRARY: HOW IMPLEMENTATION OF ISO 9001 ENHANCES THE ABILITY OF LIBRARIES TO BE USER-ORIENTED IN INDONESIA

A study submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Art in Librarianship

at

THE UNIVERSITY OF SHEFFIELD

by

PATRIA RAHAYU

September 2016
Abstract

**Background:** The academic library is one of the crucial supporting elements of education. In regards to the higher education accreditation, the library contributes to the university’s vision and mission by demonstrating high quality services. By implementing ISO 9001, the libraries have a high hope to enhance their ability to be more user-oriented and to maintain the level of their service quality.

**Aims:** The aims of this research were to get an in-depth description of academic library management in Indonesia on implementing the ISO 9001, their commitment on user orientation, and the impact to the library service quality.

**Methods:** The research methodology was a qualitative approach. The one-on-one interview with a semi-structured open-ended question method was selected. The data was fully transcribed, then analysed using a thematic approach.

**Results:** The majority of the libraries claimed that the implementation of the ISO 9001 gave a positive contribution to the library to be more user-oriented, for instance through: establishment of quality objectives, nurturing of the employees to work in compliance with the standards, and use of evaluation and audit. The contribution of ISO 9001 is also evident in library services performance. The perception of the libraries to their service was in line with the result of the user satisfaction survey. The majority of libraries claimed improvement in the users’ satisfaction. However, this study discovered issues in implementation of ISO 9001, for instance with the lack of management commitment, inconsistency of documentation and control. The libraries also face an obstacle with staff motivation and in performing an audit. There
also are external barriers related to the parent organisation’s lack of commitment and coordination issues with other departments in the organisation.

**Conclusion:** Overall, the study shows that the libraries evidently implement ISO 9001 with regards to the seven principles of the quality management system. There were aspects that have to be enhanced, however the ISO managed to give contribution to the improvement of the services by being consistent to the process approach and in establishing achievable objectives.

Word count: 332 words
Acknowledgement

I would like to express my gratitude to my supervisor, Stephen Pinfield, for all the advice, support, and guidance throughout the course of this dissertation.

I would like to thank the Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education of Indonesia for awarding me funding to complete this MA; and to my office, the National Standardization Agency of Indonesia for all the supports, it is much appreciated.

I would also like to thank you to the entire participant’s libraries; the managers and staff for the time and willingness to participate in this study.

My deepest gratitude is to my family for always inspiring me and being the source of my strength. Your love and pray help me gets through the toughest times.

I want to extend my gratitude and thankfulness to all my friends during my stay in Sheffield.

Last, but the most important, I thankful to Allah SWT for all the blessings He has bestowed on me.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ................................................................................................................................. 1

Chapter 1: Introduction ......................................................................................................... 8

1.1. Background and context ............................................................................................... 8

1.2. Rationale ...................................................................................................................... 9

1.3. Research aims, question and objectives .................................................................... 10

1.4. Terms used .................................................................................................................. 11

1.5. Structure of this study ............................................................................................... 12

Chapter 2: Literature Review ............................................................................................. 13

2.1. Quality and Quality assurance .................................................................................. 13

2.2. Quality assurance in a library ................................................................................... 14

2.3. ISO 9001 standard .................................................................................................... 14

2.4. ISO 9001 implementation in the library .................................................................... 17

2.5. User-oriented ............................................................................................................ 19

2.6. Customer orientation contribution to quality service ............................................ 20

Chapter 3: Methodology ..................................................................................................... 22

3.1. Qualitative approach ................................................................................................. 22

3.2. The research Participants ......................................................................................... 23

3.3. Data collection ........................................................................................................... 24

3.3.1. One-to-one interview ............................................................................................ 24

3.3.2. The interview Question ......................................................................................... 25

3.3.3. The language used for the interview ................................................................... 26

3.3.4. Pilot study ............................................................................................................. 26

3.3.5. Recording .............................................................................................................. 27

3.4. Data analysis ............................................................................................................. 27

3.4.1. Transcribing ......................................................................................................... 27
3.4.2. Analysing data........................................................................................................... 28
3.5. Ethical approval............................................................................................................. 29
3.6. Research Limitation ................................................................................................... 29

Chapter 4: Results .............................................................................................................. 31
4.1. The motivation on implementing ISO 9001 ............................................................... 31
   4.1.1. The parent organisation’s quality policy................................................................. 32
   4.1.2. Improving the library’s management................................................................. 33
   4.1.3. Improving the quality of library services ......................................................... 34
   4.1.4. Creating a good library image ......................................................................... 34
4.2. The understanding of the term of ‘user orientation’ ............................................... 34
4.3. The contribution of ISO 9001 in order to be more user-oriented ......................... 37
   4.3.1. How does the ISO 9001 contribute to user orientation? ................................. 39
   4.3.2. Strategy for the library to be more user-oriented ............................................. 41
4.4. The contribution of the ISO 9001 implementation in order to improve the quality of library services ........................................................................................................... 44
   4.4.1. The contribution of ISO 9001 on library services ............................................. 44
   4.4.2. The user’s perception of the library service ...................................................... 48
4.5. The benefits of implementing the ISO 9001 ............................................................. 49
4.6. Barriers to ISO 9001 implementation ....................................................................... 52
   4.6.1. The inconsistency in documentation and control ............................................. 53
   4.6.2. Lack of parent organisation’s commitment .................................................... 54
   4.6.3. Lack of management commitment ................................................................. 54
   4.6.4. Lack of staff commitment .............................................................................. 55
   4.6.5. Issues with another department in the organisation ...................................... 55
   4.6.6. Difficult to perform audit .............................................................................. 55
4.7. The significant success factors .................................................................................. 56
   4.7.1. Improve top management commitment ......................................................... 56
4.7.2. Overcome the staff problems .................................................. 56
4.7.3. Audit and monitoring .............................................................. 57

Chapter 5: Discussions ................................................................... 58
5.1. Objective 1: how the implementation of ISO 9001 in libraries is managed in order to meet user needs and expectations ............................................. 58
  5.1.1. Principle 1: Customer focus .................................................. 58
  5.1.2. Principle 2: Leadership .......................................................... 59
  5.1.3. Principle 3: Engagement of people ....................................... 59
  5.1.4. Principle 4: Process approach .............................................. 60
  5.1.5. Principle 5: Improvement ..................................................... 61
  5.1.6. Principle 6: Evidence-based decision-making ....................... 61
  5.1.7. Principle 7: Relationship management .................................... 62
5.2. Objective 2: the impact of ISO 9001 implementation on library services and their quality ........................................................................... 63
5.3. Objective 3: to determine whether a more customer-oriented approach has been embedded in library activities as a result of ISO 9001 implementation .... 65
5.4. Objective 4: The main issues and the challenges which occur in the implementation of ISO 9001 ........................................................................ 67
  5.4.1. Internal barrier ...................................................................... 68
  5.4.2. External barrier ..................................................................... 71

Chapter 6: Conclusion .................................................................... 73
6.1. Meeting the research question and objectives ............................ 73
6.2. Recommendation for practice .................................................. 74
6.3. Recommendation for further research ....................................... 75

References .................................................................................... 77
Appendices .................................................................................... 85
Appendix 1: Terms used ................................................................. 85
Appendix 2: The key benefits of the ISO 9001 principles ...................... 87
Appendix 3: Letter of approval ................................................................. 90
Appendix 4: Ethic form for participants............................................................ 91
Appendix 5: Example of Coding .................................................................. 94
Appendix 6: Interview questions ................................................................... 97
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1. Background and context

The library has realized the awareness of quality, particularly in service. With all the challenges that emerged recently, such as vast advancement in technology and the digital world, users have become more quality conscious. The library is required to maintain and improve the quality to meet the user need. Therefore, the quality of service delivery becomes the most important factor in library operations.

The implementation of ISO 9001 Quality Management Systems could be a possible option to manage quality in the organisation and some libraries, particularly academic libraries in Indonesia, have adopted it. It covers a holistic process of the library that is concerned with ‘quality assurance’ with the help of a set of standards and guidelines in its implementation. Subsequently, the focus has to be shifted from the organisation to the users and their needs, as well as the fulfillment of these needs (Balagué & Saarti, 2011).

The philosophy of quality management substantially being more focused on the user, thereby manages to discover what their needs are and to deliver the service that meets their expectations. All of them are not a stand-alone process, in fact they are entwined. The ISO 9001 standard sees how important customer orientation is, where it has become one of the basic principles of its approach and part of the clause
mentioned in the standards. The ISO 9001 Quality Management System is designed to improve the library’s ability in satisfying their users.

### 1.2. Rationale

In the process of an educational institution’s accreditation for higher education status by the Indonesian government, the library has become one of the main requirements that has to be met as a supporting element of education. The high quality library services will contribute to the level of accreditation the university is awarded and also to the university’s good reputation. To be a well-delivered library service, the library needs to comprehend what the user needs and expects. However, the library services culture in Indonesia was often doing what the library traditionally does: providing library collection and service in a one-way point of view – the library’s point of view. Dickstein and Mills (2000) call that view as the “librarians know best” syndrome. Sometimes librarians think that they have more knowledge to determine what service fits for their users; they also believe that they are able to judge the service quality better than users.

The implementation of ISO 9001 changed the paradigm, shifting the library service to be based on user-oriented. Balague & Saarti (2011) assert, “The Library is customer-oriented when it promotes direct contact with customers, collects information about their expectation, determines the quality required by them, makes this information available within the organisation and takes into account different roles of people” (p.14). This means that user-oriented should be the main focus in the entire quality system and be able to be measured. This study will mainly focus on how ISO 9001 is helping the academic library in Indonesia to improve its ability to be more user-oriented in order to improve service quality. Furthermore, it is also
crucial to investigate aspects that can be a barrier for the library in order to implement the ISO 9001 standard and hinder their goal in achieving user satisfaction.

1.3. Research aims, question and objectives

This study aims at obtaining an in-depth description of the academic library’s management in Indonesia on implementing the ISO 9001, their commitment on user orientation, and the impact to the library service quality. This leads to the research question for this study: “To what extent does implementation of the ISO 9001 improve the customer orientation of the library service in Indonesia?”

In accordance with the research question, the objectives of this study were established and are listed below:

1. To analyse how the implementation of the ISO 9001 in libraries is managed in order to meet user needs and expectations.
2. To investigate the impact of the ISO 9001 implementation on library services and their quality.
3. To determine whether a more customer-oriented approach has been embedded in library activities as a result of the ISO 9001 implementation.
4. To identify the main issues and the challenges which occur in the implementation of the ISO 9001.
1.4. Terms used

There are several terms and abbreviation related to the ISO 9001 standard and quality management system that often appear in this study. Below are definitions taken from ISO 9000:2015 Quality management systems — Fundamentals and vocabulary. List of complete terms is on Appendix 1.

*International Organization for Standardization (ISO)* is the world’s largest developer of voluntary International Standards.

*ISO 9001 standard* sets out the criteria for a quality management system and is the only standard in the family that can be certified to (although this is not a requirement).

*Quality Management System (QMS)* is part of a management system with regard to quality.

*Audit* is a systematic, independent and documented process for obtaining objective evidence and evaluating it objectively to determine the extent to which the audit criteria are fulfilled.

*Record* is a document stating results achieved or providing evidence of activities performed.

(ISO, 2015b)
1.5. **Structure of this study**

This dissertation consists of six chapters. Chapter 1 provides the background and rationale about the dissertation’s topic. The research aims, question and objectives of this study are also presented. Chapter 2 covers the literature review relating to the quality management system, the ISO 9001, user orientation, and the implementation. Chapter 3 outlines the research methods covering the qualitative method approach; the participants recruited; the pilot study; data collection and data analysis. Chapter 4 presents the results of the research. Chapter 5 provides discussion in relation to research objectives and literature. Chapter 6 draws a conclusion and provides recommendation for future research.
Chapter 2: Literature Review

The literature search was necessary to gain a deeper understanding of the subject in relation to the research topic. The aim was to identify a relevant range of references to provide a wide range of literature that categorized into three main areas: quality, ISO 9001 – Quality Management System (QMS), and user-oriented.

2.1. Quality and Quality assurance

There is no consensus definition for the term “quality”. Gillman (1993), for example, asserts that quality is a noun, not an adjective and the word is meaningless until we quantify it with relative descriptors, such as ‘high,’ ‘medium’, or ‘low.’ From the consumer’s perspectives, quality was traditionally linked to superior products or services of limited availability, made of fine materials to a high degree of manufacturing (Blow, 2000). “Quality” in a quality assurance system, such as ISO 9001, however, does not always mean ‘high quality.’ It means creating consistency to meet the pre-determined requirements and a quality that is suited to the market. In other words, “fit for purpose.”

Quality can be related to requirements which can be formed as standards, specifications, or guidelines. Those are a level of quality that an organization should attain and assure. Quality assurance in an organisation has been defined as an attempt to guarantee the quality of service offered by doing a plan and systematic action as well as a review to build confidence that a product will achieve that degree of quality (Foncella, 1994).
2.2. Quality assurance in a library

Quality in libraries involves aspects of the service, such as service delivery, staff, infrastructure, and users. In order to attain a quality level, libraries often adopt the implementing of a quality management approach in their activities. There are various quality management approaches, such as Total Quality Management (TQM), Balance Scorecard, Sig Sigma, and ISO 9001 (Saleh & Safitri, 2015). However, none of these are specific for libraries. Thus, the decision is to be made by the library is which system fits best for them. Several libraries have built their systems adjusted to suit the library’s activities; for example, NHS uses Library Quality Assurance Framework (LQAF), and IFLA has also developed several guidelines for certain types of libraries (school, public, academic, government, and special). These guidelines can be adapted to enhance their own library management system. Although there may be differences between these approaches, they have much in common, in particular libraries use principles of quality management systems in order to improve the quality of service (Balagué & Saarti, 2011).

2.3. ISO 9001 standard

The ISO standard, particularly ISO 9001 is the most influential international management system standard (Balagué & Saarti, 2011). ISO 9001 is not a standard that is specifically designed for libraries, instead the general nature of this standard can be applied to any type and size of organisation. Therefore, this standard is not only suitable for a product, but also for a service. The ISO 9001 standard offers a framework on how an organisation can conduct activities that enables quality assurance to take place. It covers 8 principles, these being: “(1) Customer
orientation; (2) Leadership; (3) Involvement of people; (4) Process approach; (5) Systematic approach to management; (6) Continual improvement; (7) Factual approach to decision making; (8) Mutually beneficial supplier relationships” (Balagué & Saarti, 2011, p.14-19). The standard explicitly states that the quality management system’s purposes are satisfying the customer and surpassing their expectations, followed by improving services and preventing unconformities (Dragolea, 2008). ISO has revised the ISO 9001:2008 with the latest standard and released it in 2015. The new ISO 9001:2015 introduces the latest Quality Management Principles (QMP) as guidance for performance achievement, with the principles reducing into seven instead of the previous eight (Table 1).

**Tabel 1. Quality Management Principles**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principles</th>
<th>Statement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Customer focus</td>
<td>Focus on meeting customer requirements and exceeding customer expectations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Leadership</td>
<td>Leaders at all levels establish policy and create proper conditions for employees to achieve the organization’s quality objectives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engagement of people</td>
<td>Engaged employees at all levels throughout the organization and empowered them.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process approach</td>
<td>Activities understood and interrelated process consistently managed in effective and efficient system.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improvement</td>
<td>Continual improvement to maintain performance.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evidence-based decision making</td>
<td>Decisions based on the analysis and evaluation of data.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Relationship management</td>
<td>Managing good relationships with related stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Adapted from ISO, 2015a)
The ISO 9001 emphasizes continual improvement in its framework and has adopted the cycle method of Plan, Do, Check, Action (PDCA).

![PDCA Cycle](image)

**Figure 1.** The PDCA cycle (Adapted from ISO, 2015c)

The ISO 9001 standard contains five main requirements, these being quality management system requirements, the management responsibility (leadership), resource management, product realisation process and measurement, analysis and improvement (ISO, 2015c). To be certified with ISO 9001, an organisation has to meet those requirements. The assessment is conducted by a third-party providing an objective measurement towards the ISO 9001 implementation.

Several studies, Santos and Escanciano (2002), Magd (2006), and Herass-Saizabitoria et al. (2010) reported benefits that an organisation gained from implementing ISO 9001, such as: increased customer satisfaction and loyalty, consciousness of more efficient and effective operations thus increased productivity, increased profits, avoid re-work, fewer non-conformity, marketing & promotion of
larger market, and better motivation and skill of employee. ISO in “Quality management principles” (2015), convey the key benefits of the ISO 9001 principles (Appendix 2). Studies have also been conducted to discover the obstacles faced by an organisation in implementing ISO 9001. According to Amar and Zain (2002), and Sumaedi (2010), large and small-scale manufacturing companies in Indonesia encountered barriers such as: human resource, management, demystifying quality, organisational culture, interdepartmental relationships, availability and quality of raw materials, availability of machines and equipment, information management, training, and budget.

2.4. **ISO 9001 implementation in the library**

ISO 9001 certification was more familiar among industries, particularly manufacturing organisations. However, in the early 90s, quality assurance started to be adopted in service sectors. In Indonesia, the trend of implementing ISO 9001 in the library has increased in the last five years. There are at least twenty libraries that are known to implement it there (Saleh & Safitri, 2015), and most of them are an academic library. The number potentially rises due to the popularity of the standard. The librarian has started to see that, in terms of management of information, documentation and the development towards knowledge management, the ISO 9001 standard was in line with those tasks and missions of the library (Balagué & Saarti, 2011).

Prior studies have found various motivations in the implementation of ISO 9001, but by almost a consensus, improvement of the library service is the main reason that drove the library in implementing ISO 9001, followed by parent organisation quality strategy, improvement of the library’s organisation work, and communication system.
Mistry, 2000; Mola, 2007; Praditteera, 2004). In addition, the positive perception of library managers of ISO 9001 gave an encouraging development to the quality management strategy and policy in the library (Kostagiolas & Kitsiou, 2008). But does ISO 9001 answer the expectations of library managers? Mola (2007) indicates that some of the benefits that the library gained from the implementation of ISO 9001 are: it standardizes work processes, improves document procedures, facilitates data gathering for management, defines responsibility clearly, and promotes the dynamics of continuous improvement. Pauziaah and George (2006), furthermore, discovered in the University of Malaya, Malaysia, that the benefits of ISO 9001 gave impact to an effective decision-making and increased customer satisfaction. It was also enhancing as well as promoting a good image of a library (Praditteera, 2004).

However, with the ISO 9001 benefits and gains, there have followed some difficulties and challenges. Praditteera (2004) mentioned that the high costs for certification, the time consumed in preparation and implementation, and a lack of ISO 9001 awareness by the staff in the library appeared to be difficulties that management faced in Thai academic libraries. While Mola (2007) on her study found the difficulties to be more related to the process approach, such as meeting the general and document requirements, and management responsibility and commitment.

The extent of the impact varies in libraries in Indonesia. It would depend on the objective conditions of each library, such as budget, infrastructure, human resources, and bureaucracy and policy (Naibaho, 2011). It is also important to observe how organisational culture can influence the implementation of ISO 9001 or vice versa (Patel, et al., 2014). This issue has become the main challenge for libraries and has thus motivated researchers to carry out further investigation on this topic.
In implementing ISO 9001, there is no restriction for the library to use other technical standards related to the library as a handy companion. Those, moreover, would enhance the implementation of ISO 9001; for example, the technical standard that is provided by IFLA (digital format code, conceptual models, or guidelines) or academic libraries in the UK that can still use Service Level Agreement (SLA) as their key performance indicators.

2.5. User-oriented

The importance of customer orientation is not a new aspect of libraries. If we refer to the five laws of Library, based on Ranganathan (1957), it stresses that the service and the books that are provided by libraries should match with the user needs. A customer orientation is an important foundation for libraries in order to deliver a service quality. Customer satisfaction can be achieved when the service received is compliant with the customer’s expectation and perception (Parasuraman et al., 1988). Customer orientation is often seen as how an organisation focuses on providing services based on customer (internal and external) needs (LengnickHall, 1996). Schneider and Bowen (1995) argued that customer orientation is about the mutual relation between customers and firms. They share values, strategy, and with full commitment for the long term. There are strategies that can be adopted, such as direct customer contract, and the collection of information from customers about their needs. The customer-supplied information can become a strong data to support the service design provided for the users (Schneider & Bowen, 1995). Similarly, Dragolea (2008) asserts that a customer-oriented organisation is able to: maintain a good relationship with the clients, deliver high quality services, help customer to meet their expectation, listen and reflect customer’s feedback.
2.6. Customer orientation contribution to quality service

The ISO 9001 is largely customer-oriented; whereby the system focuses on the customer as the main focus of most of the activities. Moreover, the ISO 9001 goes beyond traditional user orientation by also acknowledging the needs of various clients including internal and external customer, such as: suppliers, and other stakeholders) (Praditteera, 2004). This means that “a library must define its customers as clearly and princely as possible” (Balagué & Saarti, 2011, p.91). If libraries fail to achieve this goal, then their services would not be fit for purpose. Tann (1993) suggests that fitness for purpose includes:

- knowing the customer’s needs
- designing a service to meet them on or off the premises
- faultless delivery of service
- suitable facilities
- good accommodation (seating, lighting, toilets)
- good “housekeeping”
- reliable equipment (computers, videos)
- efficient administration (queries procedures)
- helpful, courteous staff
- efficient backup service
- monitoring and evaluation, including customer expectations, complaints, recommendations for improvement
- feedback loops to build-in improvement procedures and or checking that improvements are put in place.

(as cited in Praditteera, 2004, p.284.)
The study conducted by Taib, Warokka, and Hilman (2012) in the Malaysian universities’ libraries found that the main factors for the quality service deliver derived from user orientation, management commitment, information data and analysis. It found that in order to achieve the benefits that ISO 9001 claimed, it has to be with the right concept, which is basically user orientation. The interesting point is to determine whether they are aware that the implementation of ISO 9001 is not mainly focused on organisation-based philosophy — how to improve the work system, but also how to get an organisation to be more user-oriented.

According to Balague and Saarti (2011, p.15), being user-oriented can offer important benefits to the library, namely: “(1) better understanding of the user needs and expectation; (2) linking of the library objectives to user needs and expectation; (3) effectiveness in the use of library resources; and (4) a balanced approach between satisfying users and other interested parties.” In the ISO 9001 assessment, the library has to conform to the user-oriented principle and provide evidence to support this claim. It will be the focus of this research to observe how libraries comply to meet this requirement and what kind of user need analysis methods they use. Furthermore, it is also important to find out how information collected could contribute to library service improvement and continual improvement.
Chapter 3: Methodology

This chapter outlines the research methods used by this researcher in order to investigate the specified aim and objectives of this study. It refers to the qualitative method approach; the participants recruited; the pilot study; data collection and data analysis. Attention will also be given to the ethical considerations and the research limitations.

3.1. Qualitative approach

This study aims to present an in-depth analysis of the library’s management in Indonesia on implementing ISO 9001; their commitment to user orientation, as well as evaluating the impact of ISO 9001 implementation on the library service quality. Thus, a qualitative approach is considered the most appropriate method for carrying out the research. Pickard (2013) makes the point that “This approach explores issues or questions in a particular context and provides ‘thick description’ of both the issues or questions and the environment in which they occur” (p.97). Thick description refers to an action which explores the context in which an event occurred, how it was done, and how often it was done (Ryle, 1971). Similarly, Gorman and Clayton (2005) emphasise that “qualitative research is ideally placed to understand the process of events” (p.6). In the context of ISO 9001 implementation, this method can help to explore a number of aspects: how ideas are formed into actions; the reactions that appear to those actions; and the various elements in the process of implementation.
3.2. The research Participants

The obvious source of information regarding library management concerns the managers themselves. The data gathered for this study was based on the views of employees in the library management hierarchy. The position includes the managers of the library, the ISO 9001 team members (document controller and auditor), and the middle managers from different library divisions. In addition, the perceptions and perspectives of the library staff were also collected in order to enhance the richness of the data.

Table 2. The gender of the participants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Top Manager</td>
<td>2 Male, 2 Female</td>
<td>2 persons are concurrently ISO team members: 1 person is an Management Representatives (MR) and 1 person is an internal auditor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Middle manager</td>
<td>2 Male, 2 Female</td>
<td>4 persons are concurrently ISO team members: 1 person is an MR, 2 persons are an internal auditor, 1 person is member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>3 Male, 4 Female</td>
<td>5 persons are concurrently ISO team members: 3 persons are an internal auditor, and 2 persons are a document controller</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
In total, 15 participants from three academic libraries were interviewed. They included eight managers (top and middle managers), seven staff, several of them concurrently work as ISO 9001 team members. Ten participants have worked in the library services for 11 – 20 years and three participants have worked for less than 10 years. Furthermore, two participants worked for the library for more than 20 years. Fourteen participants had degrees in library science and one participant had a degree in a different discipline.

The participants were taken from three academic libraries which have been implemented ISO 9001 for at least two years; two public universities and one private, in Indonesia. The locations of this study were in three main cities in Indonesia, namely Jakarta, Bandung, and Bogor.

### 3.3. Data collection

Qualitative research can be suggested as the collection methods and the type of data collected. These include observation, interviews, content analysis of documents, articles, books, audio and video, and also statistics (Strauss & Corbin, 2014). This study involved 15 face to face interviews, as well as the collection of several related documents from the organisations, such as annual reports, quality manuals, and ISO 9001 procedures.

#### 3.3.1. One-to-one interview

The data gathering techniques relied on a one-to-one interview. The researcher preferred this method because it can provide an immediate response to a question, rather than other forms of data collection e.g. postal survey or emails. Another advantage as noted by Gorman and Clayton (2005) is that this interview method may
resolve any ambiguities in the questions posed and answers proffered by allowing both parties to explore and reconfirm their specific meanings. Furthermore, in face to face interviews, the researcher can provide a friendlier and more personal emphasis to the data collection process in order to reduce any nervousness or unease on behalf of the participants (Gorman & Clayton, 2005). However, this interview approach can lead to several disadvantages such as loss of anonymity that might lead interviewees being tempted to hide relevant facts, and open to bias caused by personality or appearance of interviewer that has an effect on the interviewees’ impression. Those disadvantages may affect the quality and the direction of the interview (Gorman & Clayton, 2005). Thirty to forty-five minutes were allocated to each interview. Those who agreed to be participants were contacted and appointments were scheduled in June and July 2016.

3.3.2. The interview Question

In in-depth semi-structured interviews the participants tend to become more involved in an interview and tell their own stories (Hennink, et al., 2011). The topics covered were the same in each of the interviews; however, the researcher asked follow up questions in regard to participants’ responses. The participants were also free to add any information they felt related to the topic during the interview. By using this method, the researcher was able to encourage the interviewee to share their experience and perspectives. Consequently, it was possible to enrich the data for this study.

The participants were interviewed using an open-ended question method. A set of questions was prepared as a main guide to ensure no important topic was omitted. The questions were divided into two categories: 1) ten questions were addressed for
the library’s manager level; and 2) eight questions were addressed for the staff level. The researcher often found the interviewees could become either a little overexcited or overwhelmed, and digress from the main topic. However, Gorman and Clayton (2005) argue that a researcher should remain open and allow the interviewee to “go off in unexpected directions”. The researcher also found that the interviews with the management level took longer than with the staff level because of the broader relevant information they could provide. Some of the interviews lasted for almost an hour and a half.

3.3.3. The language used for the interview

The interviews were conducted in the Indonesian language (Bahasa) so that the participants could articulate more clearly their own thoughts. Welch and Piekkari (2006) add that conducting an interview in the interviewees’ native language produces more authentic answers that demonstrate “more subtle nuances” (p.428)

3.3.4. Pilot study

A pilot study was conducted prior to the real interviews in order to make sure the question was clear and that a friendly atmosphere interview was created. The pilot study allows for problems to be identified as well as give warning of research failure and the need for refinements to be made (Leedy & Omrod, 2010; van Teijlingen & Hundley, 2002).

The researcher only administered the pilot interview to one librarian due to the time limitation. The librarian was a former manager in the National Standardization Agency of Indonesia (BSN), whose library has been implementing ISO 9001. From this study, the researcher gained a description of how long the interview was
conducted, and assurance that the recording devices were working. The researcher also found that there should be an adjustment made to the questions. There should also be a balance of topics between ISO 9001 and user-oriented themes. Furthermore, the advantage of the pilot study was to help the researcher to build more self-confidence and become prepared for conducting the real interviews.

3.3.5. Recording

All interviews were successfully recorded using two recording devices. The researcher used one small recording device and a mobile phone so they were not visually intimidating to the interviewee. In order to avoid noise, the interview was conducted in a quiet room. However, in some interviews, especially with staff, it was difficult to find such a room, so the background noise was obtrusive.

3.4. Data analysis

This study was using the thematic analysis approach. Braun and Clark (2006) define thematic analysis as “a method for identifying, analysing and reporting patterns within data” (p.79). This allows for a richer, more detailed and complex description of data.

3.4.1. Transcribing

Transcribing is the first step in the analysis, which helps the researcher to familiarize themselves with the data (Braun & Clarke, 2006; King & Horrock, 2010). In this study, the collected interviews were fully transcribed, and although it was time-consuming, it has likely been important to give validity, transparency and evidence of research (Gorman & Clayton, 2005; Nikander, 2008).
A good transcript depends on good quality recording equipment. As mentioned earlier, some of the recording encountered a noisy background, and some of the interview sessions were interrupted by other people. Therefore, some of the transcript was marked in the sections as having words or phrases that were ‘inaudible’ or ‘unclear.’ The transcription is an original version without any amended to maintain the accuracy (King & Horrock, 2010). The transcript was analysed in Bahasa, then the extracted data translated into English.

3.4.2. Analysing data

The analysis began by generating initial codes. At this stage, the transcripts were read and analysed to understand the participant’s views, experiences and perceptions of the related topic. The statements were highlighted to identify parts that corresponded to the topic under investigation and descriptive codes were created. The next stage was a grouping together of descriptive codes that appeared to share similar meaning (King & Horrock, 2010) and which was searched for themes. The term ‘theme’ implies some degree of repetition that occurs in two or more interviews. Each ‘theme’ must also be distinct from each other. King and Horrocks (2010) suggest that the definition of theme in thematic analysis is “a recurrent and distinctive feature of participants’ accounts, characterizing particular perceptions and/or experiences, which the researcher sees as relevant to the research question” (p.150).

The themes were then reviewed for refinement, and it was made sure that all the data formed a coherent pattern. The themes were analysed, to see the relationship between the themes and generate names for each of the themes.
3.5. **Ethical approval**

This research was ethically approved by the Information School at the University of Sheffield with the status of low risk. This research involved human interaction through an interview and analysed material provided by the organization, e.g. annual report, quality manual, procedure, etc. which were categorized as unclassified. Each of the participants were informed about the study prior to the interview and each signed a consent form to take part in this research. The participation was confidential and anonymous. No participant name or organisation name were included in the write-up. The audio recording has an identification code associated and no personal information attached.

The data collection was undertaken after the researcher received ethical approval from the department. All of the collected data was stored in University storage where only the researcher and her supervisor had access. As a back-up, the data were also stored on the researcher’s laptop with a password protection. All of the data will be destroyed once the research project has been marked and passed.

3.6. **Research Limitation**

This study faced several limitations during the research process. First, the sample size was relatively small due to the time constraints. The data collection was conducted several weeks before the Islamic Holy Day (Eid Day), which some of the library’s staff and managers were on leave for.
There is no exact number of libraries that are implementing ISO 9001 in Indonesia. There were three academic libraries used as samples; however, they may not be fully representative of all the academic libraries in Indonesia which have been utilizing ISO 9001. Therefore, it is not possible to generalise the findings of this research. The research used the native language during the interviews with particular concern for accuracy and authenticity; this was because the original meanings can easily be lost in the act of translation.
Chapter 4: Results

This chapter examines the key themes that emerged from the data collection and analysis process. It will present findings from three libraries regarding: the motivation for implementing ISO 9001; the understanding of the term ‘user orientation’; the contribution of ISO 9001 to the library in order to be more user-oriented; the contribution of the ISO 9001 implementation in order to improve the quality of libraries services; the benefits of implementing the ISO 9001; the barriers to ISO 9001 implementation; and the significant success factors.

4.1. The motivation on implementing ISO 9001

The participants were asked about the reason behind the implementation of ISO 9001 in their library. This question was asked to the management members and the staff who also were a member of the ISO team. The table below illustrates participants’ perspective about the motivation behind the implementation of ISO 9001.

Table 3. The motivation on implementing ISO 9001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement ideas</th>
<th>The number of participant response</th>
<th>Themes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Quality management policy</td>
<td>par01M, par11M, par12M, par14M,</td>
<td>The parent organisation’s quality policy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forced by the parent organisation</td>
<td>par02M, par03S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Availability of budget</td>
<td>par01M</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The management system is compliant to international standard
Continual improvement
Having a better output
Service improvement
Focus on customers
Provide better facilities and infrastructures
To obtain trust from the public
Increase university’s ranking
Increase the good image of the library and the university

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Reference</th>
<th>Theme Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The management system is compliant to international standard</td>
<td>Par08S, par10S, par12M, par15M, par03S</td>
<td>Improving the library management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continual improvement</td>
<td>Par10S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Having a better output</td>
<td>Par08S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service improvement</td>
<td>Par10S, par14M</td>
<td>Improving the quality of library services</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus on customers</td>
<td>Par03S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Provide better facilities and infrastructures</td>
<td>par03S</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To obtain trust from the public</td>
<td>Par04M</td>
<td>Creating a good library image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase university’s ranking</td>
<td>Par07M</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Increase the good image of the library and the university</td>
<td>Par04M, par07M</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the table above, four themes have emerged from the participants’ perspectives and discussed below.

4.1.1. The parent organisation’s quality policy

Half of participants stated that the policy from the parent organisation was the main reason for the implementation of the ISO 9001. Interestingly, this included the perception of participants who stated that the university had forced the library to implement ISO 9001.
“Perhaps, it.. well, it could be said that... we were forced by the university. So at that time, the university decided that the library should start to implement ISO” (par02M).

Similar with that statement, one participant said that the library agreed to implement ISO 9001 just because the university provides them the budget for ISO 9001 certification.

“This is just because we received the funds [from the university], otherwise we won’t do the ISO certification” (par01M).

Others sounded more positive on overcoming this policy. “The university requires the library to be standardised in order to satisfy academicians as well as outside academics with the fulfilment of their needs” (par12M).

4.1.2. Improving the library’s management

In regard to this motivation, many participants gave positive responses. They consist of the reasons of: compliance to international standard, continual improvement, and a better output. Five participants stated that the library wanted their management system to be compliant with international standards. “We felt that we were very disorganised in terms of managing the collection, disseminating it, then preserving it. So with the implementation of a good management through ISO, there is indeed an improvement” (par12M). Another participant reported about continual improvement, “The ISO 9001 is focused on how to improve and continuously improve, something like that” (par10S).
4.1.3. Improving the quality of library services

Two participants gave the reasons for the library’s implementation of ISO 9001. It was to ensure the quality of service was delivered and the ISO 9001 standard is the measurement. “Actually, we want to assure that the service we deliver is measured, guaranteed and standardized. .... If we do not have the tools for measuring the quality, how can we know we have maintained it [the quality]?” (par14M). The other two participants have expressed the opinion that a focus on customers and improving facilities and infrastructures were other reasons that deserved to be mentioned.

4.1.4. Creating a good library image

This theme consists of motivations from the library in order to create the library image, such as the need to raise the university’s ranking, increase the university’s image and obtain more trust from the public.

“Implementing a quality management system of ISO 9001 is seen as an effort to gain public confidence, well.. image.. The library can deliver a good standard of service and can be trusted because it has a certificate of ISO 9001 which is international, right?” (par04M). One of the participants mentioned that the university was eager to implement ISO so that it could raise the ranking of its university, both nationally and in global rankings. The participant also commented on the obsession of the former head librarian about using the ISO 9001 to raise rankings on the webometric.

4.2. The understanding of the term of ‘user orientation’

When participants were asked about their understanding of ‘user orientation’ in the library, not all of them were fully articulate in responding to that question. They tended to use examples to describe experiences before drawing conclusions. This
question was asked to managers and staff in order to gain the in-depth understanding at each level. The table below illustrates participants’ perception regarding user orientation with the themes that emerged.

Table 4. The manager’s and staff’s perception about user orientation

**Q: What is your understanding of ‘user orientation’ in a library?**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Participant</th>
<th>Quotes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Offer a high quality service and facilities</td>
<td>Managers</td>
<td>Some of the statements are: “All activities in the library must make it easy for users to utilize the facilities, be comfortable, and ensure users’ interest.” (par02M)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“We want to deliver service excellence to our users, for which there are many strategies that can be applied.” (par12M)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>“..the point is, our goals should be associated with the users, both the provision of facilities, as well as provision of information, because... the users’ satisfaction is our goal. We are here to help them.” (par11M)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Staffs</td>
<td>“The library wants to make it so that our user finds it easy to access our service. Whether in physical terms or in terms of space or other service that they seek (can be provided).” (par13S)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### The process of user identification and user needs analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Managers (four person)</th>
<th>Some of the statements are:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“For my understanding, user-oriented is.. we develop and improve service, eemm.. mainly is for the user. So when we develop it, we should, uh, think about the need of the user.” (par15M)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Staff</th>
<th>“…in this case, anything that a library does must be based on what the user needs.” (par06S)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“All processes carried out in the library are focused on users, to serve the users.” (par03S)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“It means that when we provide the services, we should first know who our customer is. It [service] is tailored to their needs.” (par10S)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the table above, the answers from participants were mostly similar. There were two main themes that emerged from their responses, these being: offer a high quality service and facilities; the process of user identification and user needs analysis. All of the participants were agreed that the term of ‘user orientation’ is about a process or activity. Interestingly, there was clear clustering of understanding that occurred between managers and staff. It reveals that the majority of managers’ understandings on user orientation were more on activities related to service excellence. They mentioned about the time reduction, easier access, and the facilities. Their
perceptions are mainly referring to the output of the process, which is user satisfaction.

The majority of staff understandings, on the other hand, were more focused on the early stage of the process, which was input. Four managers also expressed the same view. They emphasised the importance of users’ identification. The process includes collecting information from customers about their needs to design and deliver services.

Overall, the managers and staff had similar understandings about ‘user orientation.’ There were different points of view, but overall they were in the same frame of ‘user orientation’ that emphasise the commitment to customers. This may originate from the same background of knowledge as a librarian.

4.3. **The contribution of ISO 9001 in order to be more user-oriented**

The participants were asked whether ISO 9001 had an influence on the library to be more focused on customers. They also asked about the ISO 9001 contribution and the strategy they have taken in order to understand the users. The table 5 below illustrates the participants’ responses to the question.
Table 5. The contribution of ISO 9001 to be more user-oriented

Q: Do you find ISO 9001 implementation helps your library to be more user-oriented? How?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Responses to question</th>
<th>Number of participants</th>
<th>Notes of responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>Eight managers and three staff gave positive responses to the question</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indecisive</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Three staff gave ambiguous responses</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>One manager said that ISO 9001 does not contribute to the library’s ability to be more user-oriented.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The majority of participants stated that ISO 9001 indeed helped the library to be more focused on their customers. The ISO 9001 process-oriented approach claimed that it could maintain a higher quality for satisfied users.

“Definitely. The ISO 9001 could help maintain the quality of the service offered to the students. [...] If we don’t have the standard, I don’t think it [the quality] can be preserved” (par14M).

On the other hand, the responses from three staff expressed ambiguity. They sounded rather hesitant and confused.

“So far, uh, it all depends to... well, start from the top management down to the staff. If it’s for users, then users have not experienced it” (par03S).
One participant responded by using an analogy, “If the library management has been good and focused on the customer, then it would generate a good result as well” (par08S).

One participant, who gave a negative response, claimed that the ISO 9001 had no significant contribution to user orientation in the library.

“In my personal point of view I do not see it’s important, it did not have influence as well to users, honestly because users never knew that we had ISO certification” (par01M).

This participant argued that even without ISO 9001, the library should naturally be a user-oriented institution.

4.3.1. How does the ISO 9001 contribute to user orientation?

Further explanations were gained from the participants to discover in what way ISO 9001 contributes to user orientation in the library. This question was asked to both managers and staff. Table 6 illustrates themes that emerged from the participants’ responses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Participant</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation and audit</td>
<td>Par06S, par02M, par09M, par14M, par15M, par13S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service customised for all types of users</td>
<td>Par13S, par12M, par14M, par10S, par15M</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Listen to the users and follow up</td>
<td>Par06S, par10S, par11M, par15M</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Established quality objectives as a performance measurement | Par02M, par04M, par11M
---|---
Nurtured the employees to working compliant to standards | Par09M, par11M, par15M

From the table above, it can be seen that the majority participants stated that evaluation was the most significant process that contributes to the ability of libraries to be more user-oriented. The ISO 9001 cycle process emphasises a system of quality control that can serve as an evaluation measure for every activity in the library.

One opinion stated that evaluation can help the library identify various internal and external threats to its activities and processes and thus become more preventive.

“[...] ISO requires audit, so if there are threats emerging from operational activities, we will know. We have guidance on that” (par14M).

The evaluation also helps to identify a unit which needs improvement, and moreover, to identify related parties responsible for handling the problem.

“[...] after evaluation, we identified which unit needs to be improved. For example, complaints about WIFI will be passed on to the ICT unit. ICT will find the possible and faster way to handle the complaints and solve the problem [...]” (par09M).

Five participants stated that ISO 9001 helps the library to provide services tailored to what users need. “[...] in terms of lending services, our service is user orientation manifested. The user can access their loan account through the website, and they can renew books online if they were not able to come to the library” (par13S).
According to four participants, the survey on user satisfaction which is one of the requirements of the ISO 9001, helped them to obtain data on user wants and which services require improvement.

“The ISO 9001 requires the library to conduct a survey on user satisfaction. There were several items (in the question) related to ICT service. […] By conducting a users’ satisfaction survey, it [the result] can be used as a reference for the ICT unit for an improvement” (par10S).

The quality objectives were established to provide the staff with achievable targets, and were created in reference to customer requirements. Several participants stated that the quality objectives helped them respond by improving levels of user satisfaction.

“[…] if we successfully achieved the objectives, then it will be good for the users too. For example, users asked when the book will be ready after it was bought. The library has to adjust to what they need, that’s our orientation […] and ISO gave a clear workflow” (par11M).

The ISO 9001 accustomed the staff to do the work in accordance with the quality documents.

“We make a system through ISO, so anyone who positions the place, will do the same [quality]” (par11M).

4.3.2. Strategy for the library to be more user-oriented

The participants were also asked about the strategy that the library has adopted in response to user orientation. This question was addressed only to those at the managerial level. However, there were also explanations from the staff about
strategies they have undertaken. The information gathered from the interviews raised themes concerning the detailed actions which apply a user orientation strategy.

4.3.2.1. Collecting information

The most common method for collecting information from the users was conducting surveys. This strategy was carried out by all the participants’ libraries using two forms: online and printed. The survey was performed regularly once a year. The survey consists of many elements of the library services, such as: collection, facilities, the staff, and ICT, among others. Apart from gaining the user satisfaction levels, this survey is used as a communication medium for the user expressing their comments and input for the library. Another strategy was acquiring feedback from stakeholders; these refer to the university faculties. These are conducted through formal forms or regular meetings with the faculty and were carried out by two libraries.

“We have a routine meeting with faculties every Wednesday. [...] We present them with information about resources the library has which can help their teaching activities and research” (par01M).

Collecting information was not only conducted in a form of interaction, but can also be gathered by using circulation data generated by users.

“Then we observed the number of collection circulation, as the benchmark for the next procurement planning” (par04M).

4.3.2.2. Understanding behaviour

This action is a different method from the survey model. This strategy involved observation and recording responses on how users use the services.
“[…] We often based on input from observation and communication with the user. Finally, we discussed it in the meeting, “hey, let’s develop this and that. We have additional budget for this and that...” So, yeah. Then for procedural matters, we create working instruction for that” (par15M).

Another activity was looking at the trend which was happening at the time. Most of the libraries were stressed on the trend of IT for improvement, for example online service and mobile system.

“Regarding the development of a mobile-based system, well, it is because now days, users access our website not only through computer desktop, but also through the mobile which is visible from configuring the analytic. So this year we developed a mobile-based application for the library” (par10S).

4.3.2.3. Analysing the user needs

The participants commented on mapping all the information gathered and then analysing it to make a selection. They also described priority actions that should be taken. An example, as stated by managers handling book procurement: “The library did steps [analysing]. For instance: ‘mapping’; mapping to see what the faculty really needs” (par14M).

The information that participants stated regarded collection of information and analysing user needs; however, they did not mention problems or information about complaints collected from the users.

4.3.2.4. User orientation embedded in the quality manual

Participants indicated that the library has included focus on customer aspects in regard to its procedures and objectives. Although not stated explicitly, the
participants commented on aspects of user orientation in the library quality objectives and in several of its procedures.

“[…] As for the ICT, the target [quality objective] is from the number of user complaints. The ICT objective is to minimize complaints, for example: network error. Glad that with the ISO, every month we must compile and evaluate the complaints” (par11M).

“I said earlier that our quality guidelines were referring to the procedure and evaluation. All of the procedures have activities that indeed focus on the user. If I was asked what the percentage is, well, I should say 100% for the user” (par14M).

4.4. The contribution of the ISO 9001 implementation in order to improve the quality of library services

4.4.1. The contribution of ISO 9001 on library services

This question aims to discover the managers’ perception on the contribution of the ISO 9001 in the quality of library services. The table below shows the themes of what were the managers’ views and how those views were elaborated.
Table 7. The contribution of the ISO 9001 on library services

**Q:** Do you think implementing the ISO 9001 improves the quality of a library service? *How?*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Notes of responses (key words in italics)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>User satisfaction</td>
<td>- The system <em>provided a faster service.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- It was <em>more convenient</em> than previous systems.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The staff members were <em>considered capable and reliable.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A well-organized process approach</td>
<td>- The activities were <em>well documented and recorded.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The quality manual provided <em>clear job descriptions</em> for the employees.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The implementation of the PDCA cycle required <em>continual improvements.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- This approach can <em>enhance the effectiveness of procedures and working instructions.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Established the quality objectives</td>
<td>The most important qualities included <em>consistency, a dynamic process and clear, attainable targets.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Less complaints</td>
<td>It is important to <em>effectively handle all complaints.</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Generally, the managers agreed that implementing ISO 9001 helped the library to increase their service quality. In contrast, one manager was hesitant, and argued that the quality cannot be confirmed until there was a measurement on it.

“It should be, but yet, there was no measurement. I could not say. The satisfaction survey was for services, while I was more like dealing with what book that users need” (par01M).

This manager’s response may be caused by there being no measurement tools such as users’ survey in her unit particularly.

The majority of participants acknowledged that the general objective of ISO 9001 implementation was to deliver quality services. To discover whether the library has met the customer needs, it could be measured by the level of customer satisfaction. All the participants’ libraries have conducted the survey in order to gather the degree of satisfaction from the customer’s point of view. Each of the libraries has applied different methods on their survey. They only conducted the survey once a year, which covered many aspects of the library.

Furthermore, the participants were then asked to elaborate their remark. By analysing their responses, there were several themes that emerged.

4.4.1.1. User satisfaction

This theme emerged from participants’ responses to what changes the library experienced in terms of its service to the users. Responses are listed as such: the library is able to deliver a faster service; the improvement of facilities and infrastructures has been creating a better and more comfortable environment for studying; and the library staff were most helpful and reliable.
4.4.1.2. **A well-organized process approach**

This theme arose as the factors of the improvement of the service quality. The ISO 9001 process approach shaped the library to become more organised. Several participants signified factors such as: all the activities were well documented and recorded which were beneficial for traceability; the quality manual gave a clear job description for each employee to avoid confusion; the implementation of the PDCA cycle for continual improvement; and the effectiveness of procedures and working instructions.

“It’s PDOAC if I was not mistaken. So when we are going to establish a new policy after we plan, do and then check, and evaluate. That was the cycle” (par15M).

4.4.1.3. **Established quality objective**

The ISO 9001 clauses allows the library to renew its quality objectives. Adjustment to the objectives and targets needs to be made in regards to the improvement that was taken. Participants stated that there were: consistency referred to quality objectives, renew and adjustment in objectives, and clear targets for each employee. All of these factors help the libraries to maintain the quality of their services.

“With ISO 9001, every work has its targets. We know the purpose of the library. As long as we implemented this target consistently and always renewed to adapt to the changes of technology for example” (par04M).

4.4.1.4. **Fewer complaints**

The majority of participants claimed that they received only a few complaints from users. The libraries provided channels for users to convey their complaints, such as through forms, suggestion boxes, websites, or through social media. However, not all
libraries have the procedures for handling complaints. One participant explained the benefit for the library that has the handling procedure.

“We have [a handling complaints procedure]. To handle complaints, we must respond within 24 hours. But the settlement, it depends. There could be up to two weeks depending on complexity” (par13S).

Other libraries preferred to solve the complaints right away to avoid non-conformity.

“The point is, ISO pushed us so it [complaint] was all solved quickly. It is because we do not want to make a report and become ‘findings’. So with the ISO, rather than making a report, it is better quickly solved. There was the positive impact” (par11M).

4.4.2. The user’s perception of the library service

A survey performed by the libraries in 2015 indicated a good degree of user satisfaction. Two libraries have reached the scale of 4 out of 6 for user satisfaction in general or it can be interpreted as a ‘good’ level. One library could not provide the data due to confidential information issues. However, the participant from this library claimed that the users were satisfied with the library services offered.

According to the staff who were experienced in delivering the services, the users were giving positive responses regarding the service they have received. Several factors were mentioned by participants that resulted in positive responses, such as: users could obtain the information they need and a solution to their problem when they could not find any of it; and the improvement to facilities and the more comfortable atmosphere that libraries offered was also appreciated by users.
A positive response may lead to user satisfaction; however, several staff had the opinion that there were services that needed improvement. One of the staff commented:

“If I say that all [services] is good, well not really, because not all the students can be satisfied (laugh). Some were still complaining about one or two” (par10S).

The poor bandwidth of the WIFI connection was one of the complaints commonly found in the three libraries. The staff admitted that the library’s limited resources could cause complaints. It could be more challenging if the handling of complaints involved another department in the process. This could create delays in the resolution of complaints.

4.5. **The benefits of implementing the ISO 9001**

The participants were asked about the benefits of ISO 9001, apart from the benefit of the quality of the library’s services. The response from participants were analysed and the themes emerged as illustrated in the table below.
Table 9. The benefits of implementing ISO 9001

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Notes of responses</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A better evidence for decision making</td>
<td>- Provided a compelling reason to make a decision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Easy to provide data and statistics for management review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skill improvement</td>
<td>- Acquired a new skill, e.g. auditor</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Knowledge and experience regarding ISO 9001</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Gave value-added in the employees’ CVs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- The staff are more mature in handling their work</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reduced conflict with employees</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process efficiency</td>
<td>- Eliminate the procedure that is not required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Time efficiency in working hours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Cost efficiency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Reduced errors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Improvement on credibility and image</td>
<td>- The library has become a benchmark for other libraries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Recognition from associates and other institutions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Have confidence to participate in the awards competition</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

One participant explained the experience of the library when the university made a decision to allocate a budget for improving security in the library. The availability of complaint records gave a strong evidence for the university to take action.
“There were complaints from the users regarding security in the library. Items have been reported missing or stolen. We then used that [complaint] to prepare a proposal to the university. The library asked for CCTV and lockers, and the university approved that” (par02M).

Several participants from each library stated that ISO 9001 is also beneficial for personal skills improvement. The staff who had been appointed as internal auditor was professionally trained and certified as an auditor. This could be a valuable skill that adds value to an employee’s CV, as mentioned by one of the participants:

“The other benefit would be a good addition to our CV... If the staff has reached a certain level, they will have an opportunity to have training as an internal auditor. At least we gained new knowledge and increased our value” (par15M).

Furthermore, another participant claimed that ISO 9001 could change the culture of staff into being better well organized and mature.

“I would say it was more to the increase in employee’s maturity, the way they think, adapt to the environment, and give respect to colleagues. [...] ISO brought changes, especially on work culture and administration” (par11M).

The ISO 9001 benefits in reducing mistakes and re-work. This may result in efficiency in the process. Although there was no significant internal cost reduction by implementing the ISO 9001, two managers in two different libraries mentioned about the cost efficiency, such as going paperless and reducing the budget for employees’ overtime.

“We have cut some of the processes; for example, we don’t use paper anymore, and in result, the cost efficiency is quite high. Then, we use online presence for
employees’ absence. That was a cost cutting too in terms of effective working hours” (par14M).

Another benefit claimed by two libraries was that the ISO 9001 enhanced the credibility and image of the library. This is evidenced by how often the libraries became a benchmark for other libraries. One of the participating libraries was known as one of the longest libraries that had been implementing ISO 9001 in Indonesia. The library also received various awards for its quality.

4.6. Barriers to ISO 9001 implementation

When the participants were asked about barriers they had encountered during the implementation of ISO 9001, most of them could list the constraints they were faced with; there were two participants who declared not to have found any difficulties.

The table below shows the obstacles that libraries met during the implementation of ISO 9001.

Table 10. Barriers to the ISO 9001 implementation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Barriers</th>
<th>Number or participants responded</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The management members</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of parent organisation’s commitment</td>
<td>6 participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of management commitment</td>
<td>5 participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lack of staff commitment</td>
<td>3 participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Inconsistency in documentation and control</td>
<td>8 participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Issues with another departments in the organisation</td>
<td>2 participants</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difficult to perform audit</td>
<td>4 participants</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
From the opinion of most of the managers, the major barrier to the implementation of the ISO 9001 in the library was ‘inconsistency in documentation and control.’ While in the staff’s opinion, the major barrier was a lack of staff commitment. Surprisingly, there were two participants who stated that they did not find difficulties in implementing the ISO 9001.

“In terms of implementing the ISO 9001, there are no difficulties, since we have been socialising it well” (par01M).

“... because we have been doing it [the procedure] before we implemented the ISO, it was not much different to now. The workflow is just clearer. So it really is not a problem. No constraint” (par05S).

It was noticed that both participants were using “we” and that gave the impression their perception was representing others. While in contrast, the rest of the participants were mentioning some constraints in implementation ISO 9001.

The barriers themes emerged from factors that participants stated in the interviews discussed below.

4.6.1. The inconsistency in documentation and control

The inconsistency included the inconsistency in creating records, for example complaints from users were not recorded. This was because of the staff immediately resolving the complaints on the spot. This is also suggested as an inconsistency by the staff on following the procedure because every procedure required records as evidence. Human errors and time constraints were suggested as reasons for this by several of the respondents. The lack of monitoring from the manager also contributes to this inconsistency.
4.6.2. Lack of parent organisation’s commitment

A lack of parent organisation’s commitment was associated with inadequate funding for establishing the quality system. For example, one library could not extend the ISO 9001 certification because of there being no budget allocation from the university. On the other hand, the university bureaucracy was the constraint that some respondents felt hard to break. There were procedures established by the university that were not harmonised with the ISO 9001 procedures that applied in the library.

“...we want that users can access directly to our website to find information; however, because our ICT is under coordination of the university’s ICT department, it means that we have to follow their procedures. Users have to enter the university’s webpage to get to the library’s page and, for users, it’s just a long-bureaucratic access to our information” (par11M).

4.6.3. Lack of management commitment

The lack of management commitment could be related to several factors. Two participants mentioned about the frequency of changes in library leader that might hinder the continuity of the ISO 9001 implementation.

“[...] the new head of library is starting to neglect the whole ISO program. There was a time when she was away while we were audited by the external party. Once again, I was the one who faced the auditors. If there’s anything related to the ISO, it’s always me. After a long times I felt upset. So I resigned as an auditor” (par07M).
There were also concerns about an inadequate knowledge of the managers to the concept of the ISO 9001. It showed in the quote above that a lacking of commitment could influence the motivation of staff.

4.6.4. Lack of staff commitment

The second cited barrier faced by libraries was the lack of staff commitment. This may come from the resistance and the lack of awareness to the ISO 9001. The library staff understood the procedures, but not about the ISO concept of why and how it was implemented.

4.6.5. Issues with another department in the organisation

Several participants mentioned these issues, especially in relation to another department’s function and responsibility. All the decisions and processes were beyond the control of the library. For example: budgeting and ICT systems.

4.6.6. Difficult to perform audit

Internal audit was performed as an evaluation to assess the quality system conformance to standards. Several participants, some of whom are internal auditors, placed concerned on how top management was taking less into account the importance of internal audit. Furthermore, there was also resistance from the middle management to be audited.

“...frankly, there are those who are bored, wait, not bored but tired because all should be recorded. They say, ‘we don’t mind [implementing] ISO 9001 but without audit.’ They felt interrogated, well audit must be like that, right?” (par09M).
4.7. The significant success factors

There were themes emerging from the information collected regarding what factors should be improved to enhance the effectiveness of ISO implementation.

4.7.1. Improve top management commitment

Management commitment is about leadership which is responsible to establish a quality policy. They should be able to create a good environment that involves people within the organisation.

“What I see is that we have to start from the top, a commitment from top to down. We have to brainstorm on why implementing ISO 9001 is focused on the customer. The quality objectives should be sharpened to focus on customers” (par03S).

4.7.2. Overcome the staff problems

The staff issues that arose, as mentioned in the barrier findings section, included a lack of awareness and of resistance. To overcome this barrier, the participants suggest action in the endeavour, such as: conducting socialisation, giving basic awareness sessions, and building a good communication with staff. The communication includes motivating staff’s work; and explaining the quality policy, quality objectives, and the organisation’s quality management system program.

“As I told you before, what should be done is awareness, the socialisation to the staff. So we, the front line can have the awareness about ISO. It should be followed by the knowledge of the concept. It would be efficient if the staff got introduced to it from the beginning” (par13S).
4.7.3. Audit and monitoring

Half of the participants indicated that audit and monitoring should be performed by the library to assess and maintain the effectiveness of the implementation of ISO 9001 in the library. The internal audit is conducted to assess whether what had been done in the field is in conformity with the library quality manual. Whilst monitoring could help the staff in regards to mastery of the procedures and working instructions and in eliminating errors.
Chapter 5: Discussions

This chapter is divided into four main sections, each of which discusses the results relating to the research objectives. The main sections include: the implementation of the ISO 9001 in libraries; the impact of ISO 9001 implementation on library services and their quality; the customer-oriented approach; the main issues and the challenges in the implementation of ISO 9001.

5.1. Objective 1: how the implementation of ISO 9001 in libraries is managed in order to meet user needs and expectations

In the following section, the principle of ISO 9001 quality management is described. The observations from the document analysis are reported and the interview data in relation to them are presented. There are seven principles that can be used as a foundation to guide libraries’ performance improvement (Table 1).

5.1.1. Principle 1: Customer focus

From the document observation, all the libraries have demonstrated customer approaches in their quality manual. They have created quality policy that addresses specifically a customer focus. The ISO 9001 standard stated that the top management shall ensure the quality policy related to customer focus is determined, understood and consistently met (ISO, 2015c). There are actions that show user needs’ identification, and also the use of plan, design, develop, produce, and delivery of services to meet users’ expectation. These actions seem to be consistent with what ISO 9001 guidelines suggest (ISO, 2015b; Praditteera, 2004). To understand precisely of customer needs is a vital key for sustained satisfaction of customers
In contrast, the findings have not shown an encouraging result of user needs’ identification. The libraries received less input (e.g. in collection development). This is likely because users do not care much about the library. Another possibility could be that the library has less variety of user identification methods. From the observation, the libraries mostly use only survey, forms and meetings.

5.1.2. Principle 2: Leadership

The organisation has to establish policy, objectives, and strategies taken in the processes (ISO, 2015c). Every participant library has complied with the requirement. However, it needs to be analysed further as to whether the policy is easy to understand by all levels within the organisation. The result that is emerging from this study has discovered that the staff does not have an access to a quality manual. Hence, they will not be familiar with the quality policy and quality objectives of the library. The reason is that the quality manual has to be controlled to maintain the authenticity to avoid missing the document. However, it is top management’s responsibility to disseminate the quality policy and manual to employees. Balague and Saarti (2011) state, “the policy has to be concrete, understandable, and easy to communicate” (p.96). It can, therefore, be assumed that insufficient understanding of quality policy can hamper the employees’ engagement with the QMS program.

5.1.3. Principle 3: Engagement of people

This principle is about the involvement of people in the implementation of the ISO 9001, including enhancing the human resources. The findings of this study suggest that the libraries have not yet demonstrated their commitment to empowering the employees entirely. It requires a good communication with employees to build
understanding of the importance of an individual’s contribution to the library. (Balagué & Saarti, 2011; ISO, 2015a). A formal communication mostly only occurs through meetings, and the study was unable to find evidence of surveys being conducted about employee’s satisfaction. Employees are also expected to self-manage their work operation; it is, therefore, the responsibility of the top management to ensure that the employees have competent skills to do so (Balagué & Saarti, 2011; ISO, 2015c). In contrast, training seems an activity that is still overlooked by the library, which accordingly influences the employees’ confidence in conducting their work. The findings from this study suggest that lack of engagement can have an effect on employee’s confidence and ability to perform.

5.1.4. Principle 4: Process approach

The quality manual observation suggests that libraries have demonstrated compliance to this by creating procedures and working instructions for each of the activities in the library. The library needs to manage the procedure and their relation with the whole system in the parent organisation (ISO, 2015a). This is a way to diminish procedure conflict with other departments. Apart from this, the library ideally needs to establish a procedure for supporting processes, for example a facilities maintenance process or human resource process. It is believed that a good management of the main and supporting processes have relation to the achievement of a targeted result (Biazzo & Bernardi, 2003). This study has not found the evidence of the libraries having the procedure of supporting processes nor procedure in relation with other departments. This may be due to the library not considering such processes as being a priority in QMS. Another possibility is that these supporting
processes are handled by another department, for example the facilities maintenance process being handled by the university’s estates and facilities department.

5.1.5. Principle 5: Improvement

In this principle, the library shall conduct the Plan-Do-Check-Act (PDCA) cycle as a process in achieving continual improvement (Biazzo & Bernardi, 2003; ISO, 2015c). There is some evidence of continual improvement from the libraries where they use the PDCA cycle as guidance to carry out an improvement project. They found that by using the PDCA cycle, the weakness of the project can be spotted (Check), and the solution can be found and implemented (Act). However, occasionally in some libraries, the project discontinues after performing the first two sequences of the cycle. This tendency happens because the library does not receive any complaint from the user regarding the service. Several libraries also face inconsistency in monitoring and evaluation, thus this may inhibit the continual improvement of library services.

5.1.6. Principle 6: Evidence-based decision-making

There has been demand from stakeholders of the libraries to perform a transparent process on organisation decision-making (Massis, 2016). Thus, the evidence of data is a vital instrument to support the rational decision-making. The data of customer surveys, customer complaints and observation of users should be analysed and evaluated using appropriate methods. Most of the libraries are conducting customer surveys using methods such as the Likert scale. There is also management review performed by top management to review inputs and outputs and to make sure the data is analysed and the decisions made (ISO, 2015c). However, some libraries reveal that there is inconsistency in monitoring, including the schedule of the
management review. Moreover, the frequency of the survey or other data collections that are conducted by the library to the user is low. Hence, they yielded less data input to the top management.

5.1.7. Principle 7: Relationship management

The relationship management activities in the ISO 9001:2015 standard refer to the clause of an external provider, such as a book supplier, IT supplier, and particular interest stakeholders. The ISO 9001 is trying to determine the reliability and capability of the supplier and to control the item supplied in accordance with the agreed level of standard. Flowers (2003) and Nfila (2004) assert the importance in the selection of qualified suppliers in order to sustain the library’s success of delivery of a quality service to the users. The library and the supplier need to establish a collaborative strategy for the purpose of quality improvement and achievement (ISO, 2015a; Nfila, 2004). Although this principle gives many key benefits, it is difficult for the library to implement it. The fact that there is a limited number of suppliers that are ISO certified in Indonesia (e.g. book suppliers) and that the procurement system does not allow the library to purchase the book on its own, are become the constraints in implementing this principle. There is a library that omits the clause of the external provider from the scope of its ISO 9001 because the procurement process is handled by the university.
5.2. **Objective 2: the impact of ISO 9001 implementation on library services and their quality**

The impact of ISO 9001 on library services which has been discovered from the findings can be illustrated as in the diagram below:

![Diagram](image)

**Figure 2. The impact of ISO 9001 implementation on library services**

The figure above shows there are four key themes of ISO 9001 benefits to the libraries. Namely: user satisfaction; fewer complaints; a well-organised process approach; and effectiveness procedure and working instructions. These key themes have sub-themes to add comprehensive overview to the themes. Moreover, with the diagram, the connection between these themes can be clearly identified. For example, a well-organised process approach and quality objectives have a link to user satisfaction because it is a foundation in user satisfaction achievement.
In the framework of the implementation of ISO 9001 with the Plan-Do-Check-Act approach, the ultimate goal of a QMS is to achieve user satisfaction (ISO, 2015c). This view is also supported by many studies that discovered the benefits of ISO 9001 implementation (Heras, et al., 2010; Magd, 2006; Pauziaah & George, 2006; Santos & Escanciano, 2002). Similarly, in this study, participants stated their opinion regarding how ISO 9001 helps to improve user satisfaction. Some of the improvements may have contributed to the increase of the quality of the service. The faster accesses with the adoption of technology, the capability of the staff to find a solution to the user’s problem, and the conducive environment for the student to study are found as the evidence of the QMS advantage. One of the indicators of user satisfaction is fewer complaints. The library is expected to handle the complaints through the customer complaint procedure. It is the library’s embodiment to commitment (Balagué & Saarti, 2011, p.135). However, it is not yet clear whether the library’s less complaints is owing to user satisfaction. Another aspect such as the user’s culture may have influenced the way the user expresses their criticism. According to participants in the public university, most of the students are not outspoken in terms of criticizing the library. One participant explains that this is the culture in their regions. The students tend to be passive and accept what the library provides, thus influencing the number of complaints.

Another positive impact of ISO 9001 implementation is to the improvement of a process and a well-organized documentation. As it is required in QMS requirements, Balague & Saarti (2011) state that, “the organisation must document all the sets of the interrelated process that form the QMS” (p.77). These records and documents can give a significant contribution as evidence to continual improvement processes and
decision-making. The diagram (Figure 2) shows that technology adoption also influences the effectiveness of the process approach.

Documentation requirements include a quality manual which provides a clear job description and effective procedures and working instructions. Furthermore, a clear job description may affect the ability of the staff to master their job. The improvement of procedures is mentioned in several studies as one of the main advantages of ISO 9001 implementation (Santos, Costa, & Leal, 2014).

The result also discovers another factor that gave impact to the quality of service, which is the quality objective. The quality objective is the quality library commitment to customers (Balagué & Saarti, 2011, p.78). This helps the employees to “know the purpose of the library”. There is a link between quality objectives and continual improvement, where the targets can be dynamic as a result of continual improvement (ISO, 2015b). In the same way, quality objectives set the bar for the process to comply with the target.

5.3. Objective 3: to determine whether a more customer-oriented approach has been embedded in library activities as a result of ISO 9001 implementation

The finding of this study shows in terms of policy, the libraries have embedded the user orientation aspect in the quality manual. There are also three other strategies conducted by the library in the early stage (collecting information, understanding behaviour, and analysing the user needs). These activities provide the library with useful information in the first stage of service planning, thus helping the library to design services based on what the user needs. In the previous result chapter on ‘user
orientation’ perception, staff was shown to have more emphasis on the input aspect. They suggest about the process of user identification and user needs analysis. It is not yet clear whether these strategies are the manifestation of what staff understanding on user orientation is. These findings further support the idea of Lengnick-Hall (1996), which says that customer orientation is seen as the way an organisation focuses on providing services based on customer needs. Similarly, Ruekert (1992) defines this orientation as the “degree to which the organisation obtains and uses information from customers, develops a strategy which will meet customer needs, and implements that strategy by being responsive to customers’ needs and wants”. On the other hand, Plakoyiannaki and Tzokas (2002) emphasises the important of dissemination of customer information throughout an organisation to design a new strategy for customers’ needs. This dissemination was undertaken by all the participant libraries as, although the libraries did only one survey, it covered many aspects of the library services. Therefore, the result has to be distributed to each related unit for a follow up.

The user orientation is mostly found in collection development, and also ICT improvement (e.g. website, mobile system). It is rarely to be found in other activities, such as information literacy. Although one of the libraries has several programs that showed an engagement to the user, such as student internship.

Interestingly, this study did not detect any activities on user involvement in product/service development. Lengnick-Hall (1996, p.795) mentions that the organisation has to consider the customer as their partner. The majority of the libraries only deploy a survey to identify user needs. The library then designs the new services according to the survey result. However, the library is not involving
users in the process of product realisation. According to Kaulio (1998), customers can be involved in product development in three phases: specification phase, concept development, and prototyping. Based on the result, a majority of participating libraries have not involved their users in these phases. A possible explanation of this was identified by one of the participants, which is that users are reluctant to participate because they do not have the sense of ownership to the library. Another possible explanation would be that the library has the “librarians know best” syndrome. One of the participants stated that the student does not understand what the library looks like and how it works, so the library has decided to create services without involving the user.

5.4. **Objective 4: The main issues and the challenges which occur in the implementation of ISO 9001**

The constraints that were faced by the library could prevent the library to achieve its QMS goal, which is user satisfaction. From the findings mentioned in the previous chapter, several barriers and the factors that hamper the implementation of the ISO 9001 can be illustrated as in the diagram below.
Figure 3. Barriers of implementing the ISO 9001

From the diagram, a barrier can be identified into two broad types: an internal and external barrier.

5.4.1. Internal barrier

The source of this constraint is from the library itself. There are four themes that are considered as the main barriers. A constraint such as a lack of management commitment was reported in several studies. This barrier is not only faced by the library (Kaur, et al., 2006; Mola, 2007) but also by many ISO certified organisations (Amar & Zain, 2002; van der Wiele, e al., 2005; Magd, 2008; Sumaedi, 2010). The findings of this study suggest that it could be derived from inadequate knowledge on ISO 9001 by top management. Some studies (Al-Najjar & Jawad, 2011; Kaye & Anderson, 1999) also assert that a low education on quality could dampen the manager’s dedication, and thus deaden their motivation. There is a tendency for the top manager to hand over his/her QMS responsibility to people who have more
knowledge of QMS, which almost certainly means to the ISO 9001 team members. Balague & Saarti (2009) argue that “quality cannot be delegated and forgotten” (p.233). This may send signals to the employees that the top management is not committing to the ISO 9001 implementation. This study showed that a lack of support from the top management was experienced by participant par07M and it made her decide to resign as an internal auditor.

Changes in a leader can be good in an organization; however, one of the participating libraries experienced changes in the leader within a short period. One of the participants said this could influence the nuance of work because the staff have to adapt to a different leadership style. The changing of the leader can lead to the changing in priority aspects of the library. The consequence is that the ISO 9001 implementation might not be the priority for the leader chosen.

Furthermore, Balague & Saarti (2011) affirm that staff’s motivation can be easily lost if they discover that QMS is not the top management’s priority. The staff commitment to QMS would be difficult to achieve if the top management was not involving the staff from the beginning (Magd, 2008; Psomas, et al., 2010). If the managers and staff are insufficient in understanding the benefits of ISO 9001, they both will underestimate the implementation of ISO 9001. Therefore, it is suggested that training could raise awareness and knowledge of the staff and managers on the ISO 9001 concept (Kaye & Anderson, 1999; Birnbaum, e al., 2015). Less training and awareness are commonly found as the constraint in implementation of the ISO 9001 (Al-Najjar & Jawad, 2011; Amar & Zain, 2002; Praditteera, 2004; Sumaedi, 2010).
Another barrier is related to documentation and control. This constraint attributes to the inconsistency of staff in creating a record or evidence and inconsistency in following the procedures and working instructions. This inconsistency may be due to human errors, time constraints, and the work culture. Many of the participants mentioned that they were familiar with the procedure because it was basically the same procedure that they had used before the implementation of the ISO 9001. It is possible that the confidence feeling derives the staff in neglecting the quality manual as their guidance. Thus, they did not realize the revision of procedures in the quality manual. Many libraries have encountered this problem (Kaur et al., 2006; Kostagliolas & Kitsiou, 2008); however, in her study, Mola (2007) claimed that this barrier constitutes the fewest of difficulties in the implementation of ISO 9001.

Another interesting barrier mentioned in this study is the difficulty in conducting an audit, especially internal audit of ISO 9001. The results showed the concern regarding the top management commitment. One of the examples from the study was inconsistency in scheduling an internal audit. The internal audit program is top management’s responsibility (Balagué & Saarti, 2011). But because of a lack of top management commitment, the internal audit is not scheduled appropriately. According to participants, the libraries perform internal audits because it is required before conducting an external audit. Therefore, often internal audit is performed in a short time approaching the time for an external audit. The pressure then becomes high, thereby creating a burden and resistance for the middle managers and the ISO team members. This barrier is also encountered by libraries as claimed by Mola (2007). In her study, it was discovered that monitoring and measurement including audit, was one of the most challenging aspects of the QMS implementation.
5.4.2. External barrier

The external barrier is the constraints that occur from outside of the library. These barriers consist of two main themes: lack of parent organizational commitment, and issues with other departments in organisations.

From the results (Table 10), it was shown that there were six management members that claimed lack of parent organizational commitment as a constraint; whereas, on the contrary, none of the staff perceived this as an obstacle. This rather contradictory result may be due to the level of responsibility. The constraints include bureaucracy and limited funding from the parent organization. The staff does not become involved in the parent organisation’s policy making and budget planning. It is top and middle management level’s responsibility. So, it is likely to be the management that has to deal with these constraints. It is interesting to investigate the inconsistency that parent organisations showed in this study. One of the reasons the libraries are implementing the ISO 9001 is because of the university’s policy; however, some of the participants claimed that they were pressured by the university about the implementation of ISO 9001. The facts showed that the policy demand is not supported by the university in order for providing sufficient funding for QMS implementation. The possible explanation for this circumstance is that two out of the three parent universities of the participants are public universities. The government funds public universities. Consequently, when the government cuts the budget, it will probably affect the budget allocation for the QMS program in the university.

The issues with other departments on collaboration work are also a critical external barrier that is faced by organisations. Both managers and staff found difficulty in coordinating with other departments, mostly when it comes to responding to
complaints. The most likely causes of this barrier are the lack of communication and
that they do not have a QMS synergy. If the procedure in the library involves other
departments, then it is required that other departments have a harmonized procedure
associated in order to achieve the quality targets. The present findings seem to be
consistent with other research which had findings in manufacturing organizations in
Indonesia (Amar & Zain, 2002).
Chapter 6: Conclusion

6.1. Meeting the research question and objectives

Overall, the results from the study show that the libraries are managed so as to implement the ISO 9001 standard and be compliant to the QMS principles as guidelines. In the majority of libraries, the customer focus has been embedded as a foundation in the libraries’ quality policy. The entire libraries have demonstrated activities related to customer orientation, such as user identification needs. However, the result has not revealed a positive response from users. It is not due to faults of ISO 9001; it may be due to several elements that hence the desired results are not achieved. For instance, improper strategy that the library has taken.

In other principles, there are some areas that have to be enhanced such as the clarity of quality policy and objectives, communication between top management and employees, the awareness of staff to the ISO concept, engagement with people within the organisation, monitoring, and commitment to provide a qualified supplier.

The ISO 9001 implementation shows significant benefits to the library services. The QMS goal for user satisfaction can be achieved by practising an effective process approach and achievable quality objectives. However, even though user satisfaction has an impact on fewer complaints, it requires further investigation since the library has not considered the factor of user’s culture.

The strategy on user orientation mostly relates to activities conducted in the early stages; it can be identified in collection development and ICT improvement.
However, there is no evidence of the involvement of the user in product/service creation.

There are several main issues the libraries have faced in implementing ISO 9001. These are categorised as internal barriers and external barriers (Figure 3). Each of the libraries has different levels of difficulty with these obstacles; therefore it cannot be justified to formulating a rank of these barriers. Moreover, it is not possible to generalise the findings of this research to all libraries in Indonesia with only small sample size of libraries in this study.

6.2. Recommendation for practice

Based on the barriers of ISO 9001 implementation and the observations, below are several recommendations for practice:

1. Top management should provide training of ISO 9001 awareness for employees at all levels within the library.

2. Build an effective communication between top management and the employees in order to communicate the organisation’s quality policy and strategy.

3. Conduct monitoring regularly to supervise the process of QMS.

4. Perform a well-prepared internal audit and which is fully supported by the management.

5. Evaluation of the settlement of the nonconformity.

6. There should be a procedure or working instruction for handling complaints that is available in the library.
7. The library should convey a variety of methods regarding user identification needs activities, for example: focus group, interviews, appointing liaison librarian, etc.

8. The libraries should create engagement with their user by more involving users in product/service creation.

9. The library should declare and promote its success in establishment of ISO 9001 certification, so that the users are aware of the library’s achievement, thus affording a proud feeling in the employees and motivating them to deliver service quality.

10. Establish a good coordination with other departments by building communication or forming a small team consisting of people from across the department.

6.3. Recommendation for further research

Time constraint caused limitation to the number of participating libraries and the depth of data analysed in this study. Further study can be conducted with the application of mixed methods of qualitative and quantitative, for example quantitative methods can be used to gain user perceptions of library activities on user orientation. A larger number of participating libraries would give a wider range of data and information regarding ISO implementation, with variety in type of libraries (public or private), length of implementation, and the size number of their users.

Other recommendation for further research is about the study of employee’s perception on the implementation of ISO 9001 in libraries. Given that we find lack of commitment from staff as a barrier, such a study would be useful to gain an insight on how the employees see the importance of ISO 9001 and felt the benefits. It is also
interesting to investigate the relation of user culture and user behaviour towards libraries in regards to service development.

Lastly, other potential research could be to discover how ISO contributes to financial efficiency in the library.

(Word count: 14,979 words)
References


doi:http://dx.doi.org/10.1108/01435120910957896


doi:10.1108/14637150310468371


doi:10.1191/1478088706qp063oa


doi:10.1108/08880450310488012


Appendices

Appendix 1: Terms used

Adopted from ISO 9000:2015:

*International Organization for Standardization (ISO)* is the world’s largest developer of voluntary International Standards.

*ISO 9001 standard* sets out the criteria for a quality management system and is the only standard in the family that can be certified to (although this is not a requirement).

*Management system* is a set of interrelated or interacting elements of an organization to establish policies and objectives, and processes to achieve those objectives.

*Quality Management System (QMS)* is part of a management system with regard to quality.

*Quality manual* is specification for the quality management system of an organization.

*Audit* is a systematic, independent and documented process for obtaining objective evidence and evaluating it objectively to determine the extent to which the audit criteria are fulfilled.
Internal audits, sometimes called first-party audits, are conducted by, or on behalf of, the organization itself for management review and other internal purposes, and can form the basis for an organization’s declaration of conformity.

External audits include those generally called second (customers or by other persons on their behalf) and third-party audits (independent auditing organizations).

Record is a document stating results achieved or providing evidence of activities performed.

Nonconformity is a non-fulfilment of a requirement.

(ISO, 2015b)
Appendix 2: The key benefits of the ISO 9001 principles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Principles</th>
<th>Key benefits</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Customer focus          | • Increased customer value  
                          | • Increased customer satisfaction  
                          | • Improved customer loyalty  
                          | • Enhanced repeat business  
                          | • Enhanced reputation of the organization  
                          | • Expanded customer base  
                          | • Increased revenue and market share                                    |
| Leadership              | • Increased effectiveness and efficiency in meeting the organization’s quality objectives  
                          | • Better coordination of the organization’s processes  
                          | • Improved communication between levels and functions of the organization  
                          | • Development and improvement of the capability of the organization and its people to deliver desired results |
| Engagement of people    | • Improved understanding of the organization’s quality objectives by people in the organization and increased motivation to achieve them  
                          | • Enhanced involvement of people in improvement activities  
                          | • Enhanced personal development, initiatives and creativity  
                          | • Enhanced people satisfaction  
                          | • Enhanced trust and collaboration throughout the organization  
                          | • Increased attention to shared values and culture throughout the organization |
| **Process approach** | • Enhanced ability to focus effort on key processes and opportunities for improvement  
• Consistent and predictable outcomes through a system of aligned processes  
• Optimized performance through effective process management, efficient use of resources, and reduced cross-functional barriers  
• Enabling the organization to provide confidence to interested parties as to its consistency, effectiveness and efficiency |
| **Improvement** | • Improved process performance, organizational capabilities and customer satisfaction  
• Enhanced focus on root-cause investigation and determination, followed by prevention and corrective actions  
• Enhanced ability to anticipate and react to internal and external risks and opportunities  
• Enhanced consideration of both incremental and breakthrough improvement  
• Improved use of learning for improvement  
• Enhanced drive for innovation |
| **Evidence-based decision making** | • Improved decision-making processes  
• Improved assessment of process performance and the ability to achieve objectives  
• Improved operational effectiveness and efficiency  
• Increased ability to review, challenge and change opinions and decisions  
• Increased ability to demonstrate the effectiveness of past decisions |


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Relationship management</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>- Enhanced performance of the organization and its interested parties through responding to the opportunities and constraints related to each interested party</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Common understanding of goals and values among interested parties</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Increased capability to create value for interested parties by sharing resources and competence and managing quality-related risks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- A well-managed supply chain that provides a stable flow of goods and services</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Adapted from ISO Quality management principles, 2015a)
Appendix 3: Letter of approval

The University Of Sheffield.

Patria Rahayu
Registration number: 150233532
Information School
Programme: MA Librarianship

Dear Patria

PROJECT TITLE: The user-oriented library: How implementation of ISO 9001 enhances the ability of libraries to be user-oriented in Indonesia

APPLICATION: Reference Number 009004

On behalf of the University ethics reviewers who reviewed your project, I am pleased to inform you that on 07/09/2016 the above-named project was approved on ethics grounds, on the basis that you will adhere to the following documentation that you submitted for ethics review:

- University research ethics application form 009004 (dated 20/05/2016).
- Participant information sheet 1018342 version 2 (20/05/2016)
- Participant consent form 1018337 version 1 (15/05/2016).

If during the course of the project you need to deviate significantly from the above-approved documentation please inform me since written approval will be required.

Yours sincerely

Matt Jones
Ethics Administrator
Information School
Appendix 4: Ethic form for participants

| The University of Sheffield Information School | The user-oriented library: How implementation of ISO 9001 enhances the ability of libraries to be user-oriented in Indonesia |

Researchers
Patria Rahayu
Phone number: +44 7934588338
e-mail address: prahayu1@sheffield.ac.uk

I am conducting this research as part of the requirements for a Master’s of Art in Librarianship.

The supervisor of this project is Prof. Stephen Pinfield
e-mail address: s.pinfield@sheffield.ac.uk

Purpose of the research
The purpose of this research is to analysed how libraries implementing ISO 9001, their commitment on user orientation, the impact to the library service quality, and to identify the main issue and the challenges which occur in the implementation of ISO 9001.

Who will be participating?
Potential participants will be persons in the hierarchy library management, e.g. the manager of the library, the ISO 9001 team members (if the library has it), junior library manager from different library divisions, and the library staffs.

What will you be asked to do?
You will be asked to take part in a 30 minute interview using your home language (Bahasa), you will be asked about how is the ISO 9001 implemented in your library. After the interview, a review of related documents may be done to provide the researcher with further information and clarity.
What are the potential risks of participating?
The potential risks of participating are the same as those experienced in everyday life. The interview questions will not include any personal or sensitive topics.

What data will we collect?
The interview will be recorded by audio recorder, and the document of related to the ISO 9001 will be collected.

What will we do with the data?
The interview audio will be transcribed into text and made it available in electronic. All of electronic data will be stored in University storage where only the researcher, her supervisor, the School's Examinations Officer and ICT staff operating the facility have the access. The data also stored in the researcher laptop with a password protected as a back-up. While for the hardcopy document such as annual report, quality manual, and procedure will be keep in folder, no copies made.

The researcher will use the data only for dissertation purpose and it will be destroyed once the research project has been marked and passed.

Will my participation be confidential?
Your participation will be confidential and anonymous. No participant name as well as the organization name in the write-up. The audio recording will have identification code associated. The audio then transcribe and the file will be named in the same code, no personal information attached.

What will happen to the results of the research project?
The results of this study will be included in the dissertation. Several copies of the dissertation will be submitted to the University of Sheffield, the supervisor and examiner of the dissertation and to the sponsor of my scholarship (The Ministry of Research, Technology and Higher Education of the Republic of Indonesia). The results may also be reported in journal papers and other reports or presentations, such as conference or seminar, if there is an opportunity to do so.

• I confirm that I have read and understand the description of the research project, and that I have had an opportunity to ask questions about the project.

• I understand that my participation is voluntary and that I am free to withdraw at any time without any negative consequences.
• I understand that if I withdraw I can request for the data I have already provided to be deleted, however this might not be possible if the data has already been anonymised or findings published.

• I understand that I may decline to answer any particular question or questions, or to do any of the activities.

• I understand that my responses will be kept strictly confidential, that my name or identity will not be linked to any research materials, and that I will not be identified or identifiable in any report or reports that result from the research, unless I have agreed otherwise.

• I give permission for all the research team members to have access to my responses.

• I give permission for the research team to re-use my data for future research as specified above.

• I agree to take part in the research project as described above.

_________________________________        ___________        ___________
Name of Participant                                 Signature               Date

_________________________________        ___________        ___________
Name of Researcher                                 Signature               Date

To be signed and dated in presence of the participant
### Appendix 5: Example of Coding

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Statement</th>
<th>Coding</th>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Theme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Menerapkan sistem manajemen mutu ISO:9001 itu merupakan salah satu upaya untuk memperoleh jaminan kepercayaan masyarakat yah, citra yah, pencitraan yah kepada perpustakaan yah. Bahwa perpustakaan dapat memberikan layanan berstandar yang baik, dan dapat dipercaya karena memiliki sertifikat itu, sertifikat sistem manajemen mutu ISO:9001 bertaraf internasional kan. Tentunya diharapkan ada tanggapan masyarakat bahwa jika mereka itu datang ke perpustakaan yah, akan mendapat pelayanan yang baik karena sudah bersertifikasi. Yang dapat dipastikan mendapat informasi yang dibutuhkan dengan pelayanan yang baik.</td>
<td>To obtain trust from public</td>
<td>The reason on implementing</td>
<td>Creating a good library image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Library image</td>
<td>The library can deliver a service compliance to international standard</td>
<td>The reason on implementing</td>
<td>Improving the library management</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Pokoknya semua kegiatan perpustakaan mengarah pada upaya pencapaian akhir, yaitu kepuasan menurut perspektif pemustaka.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Kalau—sebetulnya kita kebetulan kalau sudah ISO kan di awal sudah ada, target-target rencana, mau pekerjaan itu seperti apa, targetnya seperti apa. Sudah ada di awal yah.</th>
<th>The library established target/ KPI in quality manual</th>
<th>ISO Contribution on user oriented</th>
<th>Established quality objectives as a performance measurement</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Iya, sasaran mutu, terus apa istilahnya ada—memang ada sasaran mutunya, sesuai ISO itu kan ada itu nya. Ada kebijakan mutu, ada sasaran mutu, kan itu yah.</td>
<td>the main purpose is to attain user satisfaction</td>
<td>User orientation understanding</td>
<td>Offer a high quality service and facilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teknisnya ke ISK (istilah teknis, 09.24) itu yah. Untuk ruang lingkup pengembangan koleksi itu, di ruang lingkupnya itu yang pertama mengumpulkan dan menganalisis data kebutuhan pemustaka, yang kayak tadi itu yah, itu adalah yang utama. Lalu mengelola kegiatan seleksi, lalu melakukan pengadaan dan penerimaan. Lalu ada penyiangan, terus ada mengevaluasi keterpakaian koleksi. Itu ruang lingkup untuk pengembangan koleksi.</td>
<td>The main step in book procurement is collecting information and analyse user needs</td>
<td>The strategy to be more user-oriented</td>
<td>Collecting information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Itu sudah, itu tertuang dalam ISK. Ruang lingkup dalam ISK itu yah. Jadi kita menganalisis bahan pengajaran, karena kita sudah tahu ya kalau masyarakat pengguna di perpustakaan kan udah ketahuan yah, bahwa itu sivitas akademika kan. Ada dosen, ada mahasiswa, ada peniliti, ada administrasi kan gitu yah. Nah kita tinggal menentukan subjeknya dulu untuk pengadaan bahan pustaka itu kita menganalisis bahan pengajaran perkuliahan. Kalau di sini namanya GPBP dan SAP, di situ ada mata kuliah ini menggunakan buku ini, mata kuliah ini menggunakan buku ini, seperti itu. Kita memang minta ke program studi, buku-buku apa saja yang diajarkan untuk mahasiswa.</td>
<td>There is working instruction for user analysis</td>
<td>ISO Contribution on user oriented</td>
<td>Nurtured the employees to working complaints to standards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluate the utilization of collection for collection development</td>
<td>The strategy to be more user-oriented</td>
<td>Collecting information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>User identification</td>
<td>The strategy to be more user-oriented</td>
<td>Collecting information</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Analysis on teaching module/syllabus</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 6: Interview questions

A. Management members
1. What are the reasons for implementing ISO 9001 in your library?
2. What is your understanding of ‘user orientation’ in a library?
3. What are strategies that the library has taken to understand what users need?
4. Does your library reflect the users’ needs, e.g., in terms of facilities, access to materials, and resource or library process?
5. Do you find ISO 9001 implementation helps your library to be more user oriented? How?
6. What are the (other) benefits of ISO 9001 implementation to your library?
7. Do you think implementing the ISO 9001 improves the quality of a library service? How?
8. What difficulties have you encountered while implementing ISO 9001 in your library/your department?
9. What do you think would most improve the effectiveness of the implementation of the ISO 9001?

B. Staff
1. Do you think the implementation of ISO 9001 makes any difference to the way you work? If yes, How?
2. Is the procedure helpful or not helpful for you to deliver library services? Why?
3. What is your understanding of ‘user orientation’ in a library?
4. Do you find ISO 9001 implementation helps your library to be more user oriented? How?
5. How do you think most users perceive library services?

6. What difficulties have you encountered while implementing ISO 9001 in your daily activities?

7. What do you think would most improve the effectiveness of the implementation of the ISO 9001?
Access to Dissertation

A Dissertation submitted to the University may be held by the Department (or School) within which the Dissertation was undertaken and made available for borrowing or consultation in accordance with University Regulations.

Requests for the loan of dissertations may be received from libraries in the UK and overseas. The Department may also receive requests from other organisations, as well as individuals. The conservation of the original dissertation is better assured if the Department and/or Library can fulfill such requests by sending a copy. The Department may also make your dissertation available via its web pages.

In certain cases where confidentiality of information is concerned, if either the author or the supervisor so requests, the Department will withhold the dissertation from loan or consultation for the period specified below. Where no such restriction is in force, the Department may also deposit the Dissertation in the University of Sheffield Library.

To be completed by the Author – Select (a) or (b) by placing a tick in the appropriate box

If you are willing to give permission for the Information School to make your dissertation available in these ways, please complete the following:

☑️ (a) Subject to the General Regulation on Intellectual Property, I, the author, agree to this dissertation being made immediately available through the Department and/or University Library for consultation, and for the Department and/or Library to reproduce this dissertation in whole or part in order to supply single copies for the purpose of research or private study

☐️ (b) Subject to the General Regulation on Intellectual Property, I, the author, request that this dissertation be withheld from loan, consultation or reproduction for a period of [   ] years from the date of its submission. Subsequent to this period, I agree to this dissertation being made available through the Department and/or University Library for consultation, and for the Department and/or Library to reproduce this dissertation in whole or part in order to supply single copies for the purpose of research or private study

Name: Patria Rahayu
Department: Information School
Signed: [Signature]
Date: 31/8/2016

To be completed by the Supervisor – Select (a) or (b) by placing a tick in the appropriate box

☐️ (a) I, the supervisor, agree to this dissertation being made immediately available through the Department and/or University Library for loan or consultation, subject to any special restrictions (*) agreed with external organisations as part of a collaborative project.

*Special restrictions

☐️ (b) I, the supervisor, request that this dissertation be withheld from loan, consultation or reproduction for a period of [   ] years from the date of its submission. Subsequent to this period, I agree to this dissertation being made available through the Department and/or University Library for loan or consultation, subject to any special restrictions (*) agreed with external organisations as part of a collaborative project.

Name
Department
Signed
Date

THIS SHEET MUST BE SUBMITTED WITH DISSERTATIONS BY DEPARTMENTAL REQUIREMENTS.